

MEETING SUMMARY
NEW YORK STATE BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL
October 14, 2021

The meeting was held by the Department of State, Division of Licensing Services, via WebEx conferencing. A virtual meeting was held to comply with COVID-19 social distancing directives. Due to the fact the meeting of the NYS Board of Real Estate Appraisal was held remotely, the public hearing section was held in abeyance.

I. CALL TO ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS and OFFICIAL ATTENDANCE

The meeting was called to order at 1:02 p.m. S. Roefaro performed roll call and announced there was a quorum. The official attendance was as follows:

BOARD MEMBERS

Stephen Roefaro, Chair
Carol DiSanto, Vice Chair
Anthony Girasole
James LeGrett
Lillian Levy
Eliezer Rodriguez

DEPARTMENT OF STATE STAFF

Amy Penzabene
Jodi DeLollo
David Mossberg
Ernest Delaney
Denise Tidings
Emily Lupe
Shannon Maguire
Alison Lacy
Paula O'Brien

PAREA COMMITTEE MEMBER

Rebecca Jones, Upstate Appraisal

***PUBLIC MEMBERS ON WEBEX**

A. Approval of Meeting Summaries – S. Roefaro asked for a motion to approve the 5-13-21 meeting summary. L. Levy made a motion to approve the meeting summary. A. Girasole seconded the motion. All members were in favor. S. Roefaro announced that the 5-13-21 meeting summary was approved.

II. DEPARTMENT REPORTS

A. Enforcement/CE Audits – E. Delaney reported the metrics for new appraiser complaints received since May 2021, to present. He stated that there were ten new real estate appraiser complaints and Enforcement completed the investigation on 18 cases to include: nine closed due to no violation, one with a warning letter issued to the appraiser, one appraiser surrendered their license, and seven complaints were referred to counsel with recommendation for disciplinary action. He added that the current caseload is 34 open cases.

B. Processing Reports – E. Lupe reported on the provided August 2020 and August 2021 statistical reports. She explained that the total number of licensees are listed by county and class code/license type and that the 2020 figures only include active licensees and may not include expired licenses covered by EO 202.11 which allowed licensed individuals to extend their license term during the State of Emergency.

C. Qualifying Education Update – A. Lacy reported that the next version of the 7-hour USPAP course was released October 1, 2021 and is available for offering through December 31, 2023. She added that education providers must begin offering the new version on January 1, 2022, and that no additional fee will be required. She mentioned that most course providers have renewed their courses for 2021 in accordance with the AQB/ASC guidelines as they pertain to live distance education, which has allowed individuals to locate courses and have more options to meet the education requirements. A. Lacy provided information on the newly adopted continuing education requirements and summarized the new requirements. She stated that a licensee who previously completed an approved course of study in Fair Housing, Fair Lending and Environmental Issues (RE-2) or (GE-1) prior to January 1, 2022, must complete either the designated 4-hour or 7-hour course on Fair Housing and Fair Lending prior to renewal. She added that a licensee who has not completed RE-2 or GE-1 prior to January 1, 2022, must complete the designated course on Fair Housing, Fair Lending prior to renewal.

A. Lacy stated that once a school has obtained approval, schools may begin offering the courses immediately and can be applied toward a licensee's current continuing education requirements. She mentioned that to date, a total of nine course providers have been approved for the new Fair Housing continuing education requirements, adding that the courses are a mix of computer based, live distance education, and classroom instruction. Lastly, she mentioned that the Department's Bureau of Educational Standards will be on track for January renewals.

III. ACTION ITEMS

- A. Update on New CE Requirements/Renewals** – A. Penzabene provided an update on the status of the new continuing education requirements and licensure renewal. She stated that CE requirements have been added to the renewals. She mentioned that when the renewals for January go out (three months prior to expiration), it has been determined that the education requirements will be based on the expiration date and not the date that the license is renewed. She added that anyone who received a renewal recently for a renewal date that falls in January or next year, is going to have to meet the new Fair Housing educational requirement. She mentioned that individuals with an expiration date prior to January 1, 2022, won't have to meet the new requirement, but if they are renewing early, prior to the January 1, 2022, date, AND have an expiration date that falls after January 1, 2022, then they will need to meet the new requirement. She added that the renewals have been updated to reflect this information and that the online renewal system has been updated as well, so whether renewing online or by paper application, both have been updated. She mentioned that the Department's website has been updated with information pertaining to the new education requirement and that Licensing's Customer Call Center is prepared to answer questions regarding the updated renewal requirements and/or process of renewing a license.
- B. Update on Practical Applications of Real Estate Appraisal (PAREA)** – C. DiSanto reported that the Committee that was formed to review PAREA criteria and determine how

NYS might adopt this program has not recently met. She mentioned that the Committee members met numerous times over the last year (five times since February). She stated that they are waiting for program development before consideration of approval, adding that they will need to know the State's intention on adopting the program. She added that the Appraisal Foundation has grant funds for the Pathway to Success for PAREA development; there is an application process for the funds and the criteria will need to be approved to meet the standards that were intended with PAREA. She mentioned that the foundation has received applications and is currently working on approvals.

R. Jones mentioned that she was tasked with getting information from the real estate educators and added that she just came back from Atlanta, Georgia, after spending a week with the Real Estate Educator's Association. She stated that they are attempting to figure out who is going to be moving forward with the practical application development because there is a real concern for who is going to be developing these courses. She clarified that she is referring to course developers, of which there has been a lot of consolidation with not much, if any, interest in course development for PAREA and many even stepping back from the qualifying courses. She mentioned that she does subject matter expert work with some online providers of the qualifying course. She conveyed her concern with regard to developers (educators within the Appraisal Management Company, AMC, have education departments that are starting to develop these type of practical applications), adding that she is uncertain whether the AMC is going to keep it specific to their employees or if they will open it up to the public. She mentioned that the Appraisal Institute is on a track of developing criteria but that the concern there is money since they are a nonprofit organization. She conveyed that she hopes to learn more about the progression of this program.

IV. NEXT MEETING DATE

2022 Meeting Dates – D. Tidings announced the tentative 2022 meeting dates:

- Thursday, January 27 @ 1 p.m.
- Thursday, May 12 @ 1 p.m.
- Thursday, October 13 @ 1 p.m.

She stated that members should notify her as soon as possible if they have any conflicts with these dates. She added that a confirmation email will be sent to members with the 2022 meeting dates.

S. Roefaro stated that there are still vacant seats on the Board and mentioned that if anyone is interested in filling a vacancy to let D. Tidings (Board Coordinator) know of their interest.

V. ADJOURNMENT

S. Roefaro asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting. L. Levy made a motion to adjourn the meeting; A. Girasole seconded the motion. All were in favor. The meeting was adjourned at 1:25 p.m.