

MEETING SUMMARY
NEW YORK STATE BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL
August 21, 2024

I. CALL TO ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS and OFFICIAL ATTENDANCE

The meeting was called to order at 1:12 p.m. S. Roefaro announced that this is an open meeting of the New York State Board of Real Estate Appraisal. S. Roefaro introduces himself as the Chair, welcomed members and performed roll call: a quorum was achieved. The official attendance was as follows:

BOARD MEMBERS

Stephen Roefaro, Chair
Lillian Levy
Susan D. Baldwin
Shanelle Washington
Eliezer Rodriguez

DEPARTMENT OF STATE STAFF

Jodi DeLollo
David Mossberg
Ernest Delaney
Jamie Toth
Alison Lacy
Candy Burchett

A. Approval of Meeting Summaries – S. Roefaro asked for a motion to approve the May 12, 2022, August 3, 2023, November 16, 2023, February 13, 2024, and May 1, 2024 meeting summaries. E. Rodriguez made a motion to approve. L. Levy seconded the motion. All members were in favor. S. Roefaro announced that the May 12, 2022, August 3, 2023, November 16, 2023, February 13, 2024, and May 1, 2024 meeting summaries were approved.

II. DEPARTMENT REPORTS

A. Enforcement/Continuing Education Audits – E. Delaney reported on the time period from May of 2024 to present. The Department received a total of 23 new complaints during that time frame and completed 29 investigations. 14 of those were closed due to no merit, 1 was closed as a duplicate, 2 cases closed with warnings to the appraiser, and 15 were referred to the Department of State's counsel office. The current case load is 32 cases. E. Delaney noted that for 2024, 50% of new complaints were referred by Fannie Mae. Currently there are 12 cases which have been referred to the Department of State's counsel office, however these are not necessarily cases from 2024. S. Roefaro mentioned that he would like to discuss this at a future board meeting.

B. Processing Report – J. Toth reported the licensing statistics for July 2023 and July 2024 on the number of Real Estate Appraisers broken down by county, class code or license type. There were about 5% fewer licenses for July 2024 compared

to the same time period last year, which is a larger decrease than previously seen. S. Baldwin asked if these licensing statistics were for new appraisers or appraisers already licensed. J. Toth confirmed that it was both and there was discussion regarding some of the processing statistics. S. Washington was curious if it was possible that some of those licensing statistics could be appraisers in the process of getting their license. J. Toth confirmed that it was possible.

- C. **Education Update** – A. Lacy stated that the Bureau of Educational Standards has been auditing appraiser licensees for the required continuing education. For January 2024 through July of 2024, 58 have been audited, 42 complied and 4 are still within the time frame to respond.

III. **New Business**

- A. **Adoption of PAREA** – S. Roefaro asked for a motion to approve the Adoption of Practical Applications for Real Estate Appraisal (PAREA.) L. Levy made a motion to approve and S. Baldwin seconded. D. Mossberg mentioned the next steps that would be needed to adopt PAREA. The Board voted unanimously to move forward with the adoption of PAREA.
- B. **Next Board Meeting Date** – The board decided that it would be better to wait until the PAREA rule or regulatory text can be presented to the board before setting a new meeting date. J. DeLollo mentioned forming a subcommittee to discuss 2026 criteria changes.

IV. **Public Comment**

- IV. **Adjournment** – S. Roefaro asked for a motion to adjourn. S. Baldwin made a motion to adjourn, and L. Levy seconded. All board members were in favor. S. Roefaro adjourned the meeting at 1:49 p.m.