

MEETING SUMMARY
NEW YORK STATE BOARD OF REAL ESTATE APPRAISAL
November 6, 2024

I. CALL TO ORDER, INTRODUCTIONS and OFFICIAL ATTENDANCE

The meeting was called to order at 1:06 p.m. S. Roefaro announced that this is an open meeting of the New York State Board of Real Estate Appraisal. S. Roefaro introduced himself as the Chair, welcomed members and performed roll call: a quorum was not achieved. The official attendance was as follows:

BOARD MEMBERS

Stephen Roefaro, Chair
Susan D. Baldwin
Shanelle Washington

EXCUSED:

Lillian Levi
Eliezar Rodriguez

DEPARTMENT OF STATE STAFF

Emily Lupe
David Mossberg
Ernest Delaney
Jenna Berschwinger
Alison Lacy
Candy Burchett

II. DEPARTMENT REPORTS

A. Enforcement/Continuing Education Audits – E. Delaney reported on the time period from August 22, 2024 to present. The Department received a total of 13 new complaints during that time frame and completed 21 investigations. 18 of those were closed due to no merit and 3 were referred to the Department of State’s counsel office. The current case load is 27 cases. J. Berschwinger compared the complaints from 2023 and 2024. For the complaints from January 1 to December 31, 2023, there were 80 complaints docketed. 62 were submitted by state agencies or lenders. Of those 62, half were closed due to no violations and the other half were referred to the Department of State’s counsel office due to some type of USPAP violation. Only 4 of 18 complaints filed by members of the public were referred for some type of USPAP violation, the others were closed for no violations. From January 1, 2024 to present, there has been 58 cases docketed. 37 of those were submitted by state agencies or lenders and of those 37 cases, 14 have been closed for no violation and 9 have been referred for USPAP violations. For the 2024 application audits, zero applications were denied. S. Roefaro inquired if the number of violations from federal agencies were steady. E. Delaney confirmed that they were.

B. Processing Report – E. Lupe reported the licensing statistics for September 2023 and September 2024 on the number of Real Estate Appraisers broken down by

county, class code or license type. There were about 5% fewer licenses for September 2024 compared to the same time period last year, which was consistent with the same percentage decrease reported at the last meeting. This is a slight increase from the previous reports that showed about 3% fewer licenses issued.

- C. **Education Update** – A. Lacy stated that the Bureau of Educational Standards has been auditing appraiser licensees for the required continuing education. For January 2024 through October of 2024, 82 have been audited, 55 complied and 6 are still within the time frame to respond.

III. **New Business**

- A. **PAREA and AQB update** – D. Mossberg updated the board that the Department of State team has been working on the regulatory changes regarding both the adoption of PAREA and to update the Department of State's regulations to conform to the 2026 AQB update. D. Mossberg also informed the board of the next steps for both these rule making packages.
- B. **Education Regulations Subcommittee Update** – The subcommittee met on September 24, 2024 to discuss the new qualifying educational changes described by the AQB. A. Lacy updated the board on the changes the DOS would like to implement in order to meet the reduction of general elective course hours for certified general appraisers. A. Lacy also mentioned that there were no courses removed.
- C. **Next Board Meeting Date** – The board discussed the possible date of January 14th at 10:00 a.m.

IV. **Public Comment**

- IV. **Adjournment** – S. Roefaro asked for a motion to adjourn. S. Baldwin made a motion to adjourn, and S. Washington seconded. All board members were in favor. S. Roefaro adjourned the meeting at 1:42 p.m.